

**MINUTES OF HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
REGULAR MEETING OF THURSDAY, AUGUST 3, 2006
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
2263 SANTA CLARA AVENUE – 7:00 PM**

Chair Anderson called the meeting to order at 7:03 pm. Secretary Eliason called the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chair Anderson, Vice-Chair Miller, Board Members Lynch, Irons and Iverson.

MEMBERS ABSENT: None.

STAFF PRESENT: Cynthia Eliason, Secretary, Doug Garrison, Planner III, Doug Vu, Planner III, Miriam Delegrange, Development Services, Debbie Gremminger, Recording Secretary.

MINUTES:

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of March 2, 2006.

M/S and unanimous to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of March 2, 2006 as presented. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0. Motion carries.

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of July 6, 2006.

M/S and unanimous to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of March 2, 2006 as presented. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0. Motion carries.

AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSIONS:

None.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS: *(Item continued from the July 6, 2006 Meeting).*

Board Member Lynch nominated and the Board voted unanimously to re-elect Nancy Anderson as Chair and Randall Miller as Vice-Chair.

ACTION ITEMS:

1. Certificate of Approval - CA06-00012 –1530 & 1532 Ninth Street. Applicant: Mohamed Elhashash. The applicant is requesting a new Certificate of Approval to alter more than thirty percent (30%) of the value of three historically designated single-family homes. The site is located at 1530 and 1532 Ninth Street within an R-4, Neighborhood Residential Zoning District.

Cynthia Eliason, Supervising Planner, presented staff report. On May 4, 2006, the Historical Advisory Board acted to deny a Certificate of Approval CA06-0009. The applicant has since been working with Staff and representatives of the Alameda Architectural Preservation Society (AAPS) to revise plans to address design concerns raised at the May HAB meeting. Staff is recommending the Board approve the Certificate of Approval CA06-0012, with conditions as stated in the draft Resolution.

Chair Anderson opened the public hearing.

Miriam Delagrange, Project Manager, Development Services, spoke in favor of the revised design.

Dick Rutter, AAPS, reviewed a letter submitted by AAPS and is in favor of approving the Certificate of Approval.

Li-Sheng Fu, architect, spoke in favor of revised design. He informed the Board that he is willing to incorporate AAPS's suggestions into the plans. He informed the Board that the plans for the rear building have not changed and that all the exterior doors will match the existing doors.

Chris Buckley, AAPS, spoke in favor of approving the Certificate of Approval with the conditions stated in letter submitted by AAPS.

Kevin Frederick, 1287 Caroline St. spoke in opposition of the revised design.

There were no further speaker slips, Chair Anderson closed the public hearing and opened the floor to Board discussion.

Board Member Lynch thanked the applicant for his attempt to incorporate the Board's suggestions into the revised plan. She feels that the revised plans do not include enough of the original design details. She would like to see the details match a photograph of a similar house built around the same time which is located down the street.

Board Member Irons is in favor of approving the revised plans. He asked for clarification from Board Member Lynch as to what details she is referring to. He stated that it was his understanding that design details does not fall under this Board's purview.

Ms. Eliason stated that the Board should only be considering the partial demolition of the existing structure, not the proposed design. Board Member Lynch disagreed with staff and read from the Municipal Code that the HAB is charged with the responsibility “to encourage new building and developments that will be harmonious with existing buildings and neighborhoods” Board Member Lynch added that the Board can’t encourage harmonious designs if it doesn’t see those designs.

Vice-Chair Miller is not in favor of approving the Certificate of Approval. He feels this project would create parking issues in the neighborhood.

Board Member Iverson also thanked the architect for revising the plans. She would like to see the front detail match an existing house which is located down the street.

M/S (Irons, Miller) to approve Certificate of Approval CA06-0012, to alter more than thirty percent of the value of three historically designated single-family homes located at 1530 & 1532 ½ Ninth Street. 1-4-0.

Ayes: 1(Irons); Noes: 4; Absent: 0; Motion failed. Item deemed denied.

M/S (Lynch, Iverson) and unanimous to continue this item to a future meeting to allow the applicant to incorporate the Board’s comments into the plans. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0. Motion carries..

Secretary Eliason stated that staff will inform the Board if the applicant chooses to revise the plans.

2. a. Certificate of Approval - CA06-0017 - 2020 Oak Street. Applicant: Richard Hornberger. Applicant requests a Certificate of Approval to move an existing, pre-1909 dwelling from its existing site to the corner of Oak Street and Blanding Avenue. Both sites are within the M-2, General Industrial Zoning District. and;

b. Certificate of Approval - CA06-0018 - 2319 Clement Avenue. Applicant: Richard Hornberger Applicant requests a Certificate of Approval to permit the demolition of a vacant pre-1909 industrial building. The site is located within the M-2, General Industrial (Manufacturing) Zoning District.

Cynthia Eliason, Supervising Planner presented the staff report. The Board will be considering two separate Certificates of Approval. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Approval to move an existing residence from a site at 2020 Oak Street to the corner of Oak Street and Blanding Ave. Further, the applicant requests a Certificate of Approval to permit the demolition of the industrial building located at 2319 Clement Ave. These requests are part of a project to expand the Perforce Software facility located at 2320 Blanding Ave. Staff is recommending approval of CA06-0017 and CA06-0018 with the conditions as stated in the draft resolutions.

Chair Anderson opened the Public hearing.

Ken Carvallo and Christopher Buckley, AAPS, spoke in favor of approving both Certificates of Approvals.

There were no further speaker slips. Chair Anderson closed the public hearing and opened the floor to Board discussion.

The Board had no concerns with either proposal.

M/S (Iverson, Lynch) and unanimous to approve CA06-0017, to move an existing, pre-1909 dwelling from its existing site to the corner of Oak Street and Blanding Ave. and CA06-0018, to permit the demolition of a vacant pre-1909 industrial building located at 2319 Clement Ave. with conditions as stated in draft resolutions. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0; Motion carries.

3. Certificate of Approval - CA06-0015 – Applicant: Phong T. & Lieu Dinh - 1343 Fernside Blvd. The applicants request a Certificate of Approval to alter more than thirty percent of the value of a pre-1942 single family residence. The proposed work includes the addition of approximately 1,450 square feet first story and new second story for an attached garage and living space, removal/replacement of the exterior siding, windows, interior walls and roof. The site is located at 1343 Fernside Blvd. within an R-1, One Family Residence Zoning District.

Cynthia Eliason, Supervising Planner, presented the staff report. In 2006, the applicant received several permit approvals for repair and replacement work to the structure, which cumulatively have resulted in exceeding the thirty percent (30%) removal provisions within a five (5) year period. In addition, the applicant is requesting further demolition to the roof system as well as a new addition to the structure to add a two-car garage and additional second-story living area.

Staff is recommending that the Board 1) include 1343 Fernside Blvd. on the Historical Building Study List as an “H” designation, 2) deny the portion of the Certificate of Approval for demolition associated with the proposed addition of a two-car garage and living area and 3) approve the portion of the Certificate of Approval associated with window and siding replacements and new roof with conditions as stated in draft resolution.

Ms. Eliason informed the Board that all comments made by the Board will be forwarded to the Planning Board.

Chair Anderson commended staff on their report and opened the Public Hearing.

Andy Anderson, 1348 Fernside, spoke in favor of the project and read a letter from Sylvia Hudson, Heather and Erin Lambert, who were also in favor of moving this project forward.

Richard Rutter, AAPS, spoke in favor of staff's recommendation to deny the Certificate of Approval for the addition.

Gary Longoria, 3292 Briggs, opposes the proposed addition. He stated that it will block his windows in living room dining room and bedroom. He is also concerned with the dead oak tree on the rear of the property.

Tom Pavao, 1337 Fernside, spoke in favor of staff's recommendation to deny the addition.

Chris Buckley, AAPS, commended staff on their report. He reviewed comments submitted by AAPS and would like them incorporated into the draft Resolution.

Betsy Matheson, 1185 Park Ave., is not in favor of proposed addition. She would like to see this property included on the Historic Building Study List.

Phong Dinh, applicant/owner, informed the Board that prior to purchasing the property, he was told by Staff that the addition would be approved. Once construction began, he discovered additional damage done by a previous fire. He noted that he has tried to comply with all of staff's requests.

Kevin Frederick, 1287 Caroline St., commended staff on their report. He is not in favor of the proposed addition.

There were no further speaker slips. Chair Anderson closed the public hearing and opened the floor to Board discussion.

Board Member Irons commended staff on their report. He noted that as a contractor, he understands the cost of restoring this building would be very high.

Board Member Iverson also commended staff on their report. She would like the building restored to the way it looked in the 1979 photo.

Vice-Chair Miller spoke in favor of staff's recommendations. He would also like to see the house restored to the way it looked in the 1979 photo.

Board Member Lynch spoke in favor of including the property on the Historic Building Study list. She would like a 1979 photo be provided to all property owners of listed houses. She noted that she is not in favor of the proposed addition. She pointed out that the staff report mentioned the shutters as a signature detail of the Craftsman style. However those particular shutters are not original, nor are shutters a Craftsman style hallmark.

Chair Anderson noted the unique detailing that is replicate of that craftsman style cottage. She is in favor of including to the Historic Building Study List as an H designation. She would like to see the property restored to the way it was in 1979. She stated the dormer windows on the front façade should not be changed as they are a very important characteristic of this style of house.

In response to Board Member Irons inquiry regarding whether the proposed addition is within the purview of this Board, Ms. Eliason stated that the demolition of the side walls for the proposed addition is under the purview of this Board because the applicant has exceeded 30 % over a period of five years.

Board Member Irons noted that if this Board requires the applicant to restore this back to the way it looked in 1979, then the applicant may again apply for an addition, without coming before this Board. That would be very costly to the property owner, and he is within his rights to build an addition on his property.

After separately reviewing each condition, the Board approved staffs recommendation for conditions one and three. The Board would like conditions two, four, five and six be revised to incorporate AAPS's comments.

M/S (Lynch, Iverson) and unanimous to include 1343 Fernside Blvd. to the Historic Building Study List as an H designation. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0; Motion carries.

M/S (Irons, Miller) to approve the portion of the Certificate of Approval CA06-0015, associated with window and siding replacements with revised conditions submitted by AAPS. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0; Motion carries.

M/S (Miller, Lynch) and unanimous to deny the partial demolition associated with the proposed addition of an existing dwelling at 1343 Fernside. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0; Motion carries.

Board member Lynch stated that she would like staff to give updates on this project as it moves forward.

Chair Anderson called a 10 minute recess.

Chair Anderson reconvened the meeting.

4. Certificate of Approval CA06-0014 – Applicant: Sebastian Martinez for Raul Reyes Tapia, 1534 Buena Vista Avenue. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Approval for demolition of the remainder of a residential structure built prior to 1942, located at the above address, for the purposes of constructing a new single-family dwelling. The site is located within an R-4, Neighborhood Residential Zoning District.

Doug Vu, Planner III, presented the staff report. He informed the Board that the applicants are requesting a Certificate of Approval to allow demolition of the remaining thirty-five (35) percent

of a residential structure at 1534 Buena Vista Avenue that was destroyed by two fires. The building was constructed in 1909, but is not listed on the Historical Building Study List.

Mr. Vu stated that the proposed project is brought before the Board because it involves partial demolition of a structure built prior to 1942. Given the amount of damage already sustained to the building, the applicants are proposing to remove the remaining garage and three storage rooms on the ground floor in order to construct a new single-family dwelling. Staff will continue to work with the applicants to ensure the new residence is consistent with the intended design approach and compatible with the surrounding neighborhood. Staff is recommending approval of Certificate of Approval, CA06-0014, to allow the demolition of the remainder of the structure at 1534 Buena Vista Ave., with conditions as stated in draft Resolution.

In response to Board Member Lynch's inquiry regarding the proposed new single-family dwelling, Mr. Vu stated that staff will consider any comments made by this Board tonight during the Design Review process.

Chair Anderson opened the public hearing.

Kevin Frederick, 1287 Caroline St., requested that the owner try to salvage any of the historic materials during the demolition.

Sebastian Martinez, architect, stated that he will make every effort to match original house.

There were no further speaker slips. Chair Anderson closed the public hearing and opened the floor to Board discussion.

The Board thanked the applicant for reviewing the plans for the new single-family dwelling.

M/S (Irons, Lynch) and unanimous to approve Certificate of Approval, CA06-0014, for the demolition of the remainder of an existing dwelling at 1534 Buena Vista Ave. 5-0-0.

Ayes: 5; Noes: 0; Absent: 0; Motion carries.

5. Certificate of Approval – CA06-0022 – Applicant: Fargo Farnesi Inc. – 2427 Clement Ave. The applicant requests a Certificate of Approval to demolish more than thirty percent (30%) of a commercial structure, portions of which were constructed prior to 1942, located at the above address for the purpose of expanding the existing business. The site is located at 2427 Clement Ave. within an M-2, General Industrial (Manufacturing) District.

Doug Garrison, Planner III, presented the staff report. Due to the scope of existing structural problems, it may be necessary to completely demolish and then rebuild the entire building. The reconstructed building would incorporate the important design elements and building materials of the original structure. The front façade of the building contains the architectural details that are of most interest stylistically and as an historic resource. These details will be preserved or rebuilt with similar materials.

Mr. Garrison stated that staff along with the applicant, held a neighborhood meeting and redesigned the original proposal to meet the concerns of the neighbors.

Staff is recommending approval of Certificate of Approval CA06-0022, for the demolition of a commercial structure, located at 2427 Clement Ave.

Chair Anderson opened the public hearing.

Dick Rutter, AAPS, is not in favor of this project because of the 100 ft height limit. He would like to see the community try to lower the height limit.

Shawn Smith, architect for the owner, spoke in favor of project.

In response to Chair Anderson inquiry regarding the use of the new structure, Mr. Smith stated that currently this property houses a commercial wood cabinet shop.

Kevin Frederick, 1287 Caroline St., is also concerned with the height limit.

There were no further speaker slips. Chair Anderson closed the public hearing and opened the floor to Board discussion.

Chair Anderson is in favor of approving this project, with the exception of the height and the clapboard siding.

M/S and unanimous to continue the meeting past 10:00 p.m. 5-0-0.

Board Member Iverson spoke in favor of rebuilding the front façade to match original storefront. She also noted that the proposed height will be too large for the surrounding area.

Board Member Irons spoke in favor of staff's recommendation to grant the Certificate of Approval for the demolition.

In response to Board Member Iron's inquiry regarding whether the height limit and proposed design of the new building falls under this Board's purview, Ms. Eliason stated that this Board should only be considering the demolition of the existing structure. Ms. Eliason stated that staff would consider their comments during the Design Review process.

Board Member Lynch does not think the front façade should remain. She would like Condition 3 be removed from the draft Resolution. She also stated that the proposed project is too big for the surrounding area.

M/S (Lynch, Miller) to approve Certificate of Approval CA06-0022, for the demolition of a commercial structure, subject with conditions one and two only, and delete condition three from draft Resolution. 4-1-0.

Ayes: 4; Noes: 1; (Iverson); Absent: 0; Motion carries.

REPORTS:

6. Review and Comment on Proposed Revisions to the Historical Preservation Ordinance. Staff is requesting this item be continued to the Regular meeting of September 7, 2006.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: (Discussion only)

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:

Board Member Lynch presented the Board a copy of the book "Taking Care of Business, Historic Commercial Buildings of the Island City" by Woodruff Minor.

STAFF COMMUNICATION:

None.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 10:25 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

Cynthia Eliason, Secretary
Historical Advisory Board

G:\PLANNING\HAB\AGENMIN\Agenmin.06\08-03-06\08-03-06 DRAFT min.doc